

# Yavapai County Workforce Development Board November 14, 2018 Meeting Minutes

Attendees:	Present/Absent	Number of Absences in 2018
Anita Payne, Chairman	Absent	1
Phil Tovrea, Vice-Chairman	Present	0
Steve Silvernale	Absent	2
Gary Hassen	Present	1
Mark Timm	Absent	2
Mel Ingwaldson	Absent	1
Pam Blackburn	Present	0
Alycia Botkin	Present	0
Elaine Bremner	Present	0
Wendy Bridges	Present	1
Rick Duff	Present	1
Tony Gauthier	Absent	1
Kurt Greves	Present	1
Dee Jenkins	Present	0
Nancy Jensen	Present	0
Ginger Johnson	Present	0
Craig Lefever	Present	0
Christopher Tafoya	Present	0

\*Excused

**Guests:** Thomas Thurman, District 2 Yavapai County Supervisor

**Staff:** Teri Drew, Executive Director  
Leah Cickavage, Operations Manager  
Julia Sawyer, Executive Assistant

**I. Call to Order/Welcome/Introductions**

Vice Chairman Phil Tovrea called the meeting to order at 10:06 AM. A quorum was not present at the call to order. Vice Chairman Tovrea asked for introductions around the table, beginning with new member Dee Jenkins. Councilor Jenkins gave a brief introduction of herself, as did Chris Tafoya of Title III and Alycia Botkin of Title IV. A quorum was met during introductions. Executive Director Teri Drew thanked Nancy Jenkins for accommodating the WDB at the Northern Arizona University (NAU) Campus of Prescott Valley. She also stated that Chairman Payne is on special assignment in California for a year and has been attending the Executive Committee meetings via teleconference.

## II. Reading of the WDB Mission Statement

Vice Chairman Tovrea read the Mission Statement of the WDB – “to Build Economic Success through Workforce Development Partnerships”.

## III. Approval of the August 8, 2018 Minutes

Vice Chairman Tovrea asked for a motion to approve the August 14, 2018 meeting minutes. **So moved by Gary Hassen , seconded by Wendy Bridges.** A comment on the minutes was made by Ginger Johnson, noting appreciation to the staff for the time and effort put into the meetings and the minutes. Ms. Drew noted the teamwork at the office and acknowledged Julia Sawyer as the main scribe, and thanked Ms. Johnson for her comment. Vice Chairman Tovrea called for a vote on the motion to approve. **The motion carried unanimously.**

## IV. Chair’s Report

### ➤ Membership Considerations/Ratification

Vice Chairman Tovrea noted the new members of the WDB and called for a vote to ratify Alicia Botkin, Councilwoman Dee Jenkins and Christopher Tafoya – all of which have been appointed by the Board of Supervisors. Ms. Drew noted that, because Public Sector and Private Sector are mixed on this Board, and the state requires percentages of each in order for the Board to be certified by the Governor, the Executive Committee recommended these individuals to the Board of Supervisors for approval. Chairman Payne has requested a vote from the full Board to ratify the nominations. Vice Chairman Tovrea called for a vote to ratify, **the Board unanimously voted in favor of ratification of the approved memberships.**

### ➤ One Stop Operator Selection/Ratification

Vice Chairman Tovrea then began discussion on the One Stop Operator selection and ratification. Ms. Drew offered explanation on behalf of Vice Chairman Tovrea and in Chairman Payne’s absence. She detailed the Request for Proposals (RFP) process for One Stop Operator, noting that the Board had issued an RFP for One Stop Operator in 2014. She noted that there was no budget identified for the One Stop Operator in the previous RFP because there were no funds identified for it. NACOG was chosen as the One Stop Operator at that time. The State of Arizona audited the RFP process that was followed, and noted that the RFP must have a budget. A budget of \$20,000 was established by the Board. NACOG contributed \$5,000, and the RFP went out. Ms. Drew noted that three agencies picked up RFP packages, but NACOG is the only respondent to turn in their proposal. Ms. Drew reported that the Executive Committee reviewed and evaluated NACOG’s response to the RFP, voting unanimously to recommend NACOG with a 100% score to the full Board for ratification. Vice Chairman Tovrea noted that the Executive Committee was in favor and asked for comments or questions. He called for a motion to approve NACOG as the One Stop Operator for Yavapai County, **so moved by Gary Hassen.** Vice Chairman Tovrea called for a vote. **The motion carried unanimously.**

### ➤ Executive Director Negotiations Report

Ms. Drew explained the process thus far of the Board developing a job description for the Executive Director, then by majority vote of the Board she was appointed as Executive Director of the WDB. The board then began negotiations with NACOG regarding compensation for Ms. Drew’s new appointment. Ms. Drew reported that last week the Executive Committee met with NACOG Executive Director Chris Fetzer following several months of communication. Mr. Fetzer and the Executive Committee came to an agreement for a percentage increase in salary compensatory to the job description and responsibilities of the Executive Director. She noted that this does not require a vote, but is information only. Vice Chairman Tovrea commented that he found the roles and responsibilities of the Board, NACOG and the Board of Supervisors to be interesting. He also noted the NACOG Economic Development District that Ms. Drew also manages. He asked if the

Roles and Responsibilities document had been updated for Board of Supervisors approval as of yet, to which Ms. Drew answered that it is still being developed between herself and Mr. Fetzer. Vice Chairman Tovrea noted the importance of this issue as it relates to a smooth-running organization equitable to all parties. Gary Hassen asked for the Executive Committee to be permitted to e-vote to ratify the formal agreement sooner than the next meeting in January, as this has been going on for several months. Ms. Drew noted that she has a draft to submit to the Executive Committee for an e-vote. Vice Chairman Tovrea authorized Ms. Drew to proceed on behalf of the Board.

## V. Director's Report

### ➤ Program Update

Ms. Drew began her report by informing the Board that the Economic Workforce Development Division of NACOG has a section in the Prescott E-News, and offered to the partners and private sector members an opportunity to submit any stories of success they would like to include in that section.

### ➤ Board Recertification

Ms. Drew described the process of Board Recertification, noting the Workforce Arizona Council (WAC) has asked for recertification of all boards. She shared that the WAC's membership is similar to the local WDB but on a much larger scale, with mega-company representation in Phoenix. She reported that Yavapai County Supervisor Randy Garrison has submitted his application for membership to the WAC as a private business owner in Yavapai County, and is expected to be appointed soon.

Ms. Drew continued to report that our application has been sent in and is being review, noting that the roster of our members is being reviewed regarding the constitution of our board. Yesterday the WAC Performance Excellence Committee announced that they will not be recertifying any boards in the state because they feel there are deficiencies in all areas, and they will review the boards again in February. Ms. Drew asked for questions. Wendy Bridges asked if anything is needed from the members of this board to assist, Ms. Drew thanked her for asking and noted that if anything is needed staff will reach out. Ms. Drew noted that the board is certified until it is re-certified, so business will carry on as usual. She also noted that if the boards are not certified by the State, the State is no longer in compliance with the Department of Labor.

The One Stop Comprehensive Centers have to be recertified as well, noting that this is another long and involved application process. The application process was completed last year, but the WAC sent it back to improve in certain areas. She highlighted some of the remedies to improvements and noted that all points of concern have been accomplished in both the Cottonwood and the Prescott One Stops. Ms. Drew noted that she is waiting to see what the decision will be in 2 weeks.

Ms. Drew noted that one of the remedies was to have a Title II visibility in the One Stops. Title II has set aside \$14,913 toward shared system costs. Part of the Title II funding will include the purchase of laptops loaded with WIOA information and set up for client use in Adult Basic Education as a point of value to their program. Ms. Drew described the goal in working with Title II Adult Basic Education to assist them in meeting new performance standard requirements of job placement through Titles I and III, follow up services and performance – all direct benefits to their partnership.

Ms. Drew concluded that all required components have been satisfied, and the One Stops should receive recertification in November. Comments followed regarding the need to develop ease of use of the computers in signing up for a class at Yavapai College, noting that the computer program doesn't direct how to sign up as a new user. Ms. Drew noted that the One Stops have guidelines

how to log on, crediting Title III for core services to help individuals navigate through the resource rooms and search engines. She agreed the information could be updated.

Ms. Drew reported that she is working with Cable One for a new commercial, as the first commercial was successful but has run its course. She noted that some board members were interviewed previously and that those interviews may be used in the new commercial. The goal for the new commercial will be to focus more toward client/labor/worker recruitment. The previous commercial was more focused on employer recruitment.

➤ **Title I Performance Accountability Measures**

Ms. Drew noted that Title I performance measures are the only performance measure that require approval by the board. She noted that the WAC Performance Review Committee meeting yesterday featured a partner who stated that local boards are serving an injustice to the public, noting that local boards work under the umbrella of the county, and the county runs the program, setting their own performance and budget. Ms. Drew remarked that this is not the case in Yavapai County, and she noted that Yavapai County was used as a positive example because Yavapai County contracts the program to NACOG. Ms. Drew said that discussion is now circulating and is being proposed to bid out the Title I program in all local areas. Ms. Drew remarked that this policy would not be good for the other cities and counties in the state, as it would be a huge undertaking for each area.

She reported Yavapai County's Title I performance and handed out a chart for everyone to review, demonstrating the goals for the coming year as well as the successes for 2017-18. She noted that the 2017 performance was exceeded, with an average of about 126%. She highlighted the successes and congratulated the board and staff for the performance gains. Ms. Drew reported that the state has added performance measures to Yavapai County since it does so well. She noted that these performance measures were approved by the Executive Committee and is to be voted on by the full board at this time. She detailed the percentages targeted for this year in Adult, Youth, and Dislocated Worker categories, noting significant increases in some areas. She recommended these negotiated performance measures, expecting to be able to meet and exceed them. Ms. Drew paused for questions and comments. Supervisor Thurman asked a question about the salary goals and what timeframes they represent, and Ms. Drew noted these are quarterly. Nancy Jensen asked about the credential percentage, Ms. Drew noted that these are limited to the clients we employ or train/spend money on. Discussion followed on the testing process that is done in Yavapai County to determine if an individual is suited to the career path they are pursuing. Ms. Drew noted that this is prudent in the vetting process of clients. She described several scenarios that can be counted as a credential, including industry-based credential. A question was asked whether this includes the Arizona Career Readiness Credential (ACRC), to which Ms. Drew replied yes, it is a state-recognized credential. Other questions and comments followed regarding these statistics, whether it is a national standard, and if all states are held to the same measures. Ms. Drew noted that she would ask some of the other states that she is acquainted with through USWA. More discussion followed regarding salary goals and other performance standards. Craig Lefever described the measurable skills gains, which is a statistic that Title II is interested in, and related it to Title II reporting. Nancy Jensen asked for an explanation of negotiated levels. Ms. Drew remarked that performance is how the money flows, and performance is based on unemployment data, underemployment, loss of business and poverty rates. She noted that the state of Arizona negotiates with the federal U.S. Department of Labor, and the State then negotiates with local areas to achieve those recommended levels based on historical data. For areas that fail to meet standards there is a requirement to provide corrective action. Ms. Drew reported that in the past, performance was tracked by a state database, and that database has not been available for two years now, making it more difficult to

track performance on the local level. She noted that Yavapai County has tracked their own numbers locally, since the state database is not available.

Vice Chairman Tovrea called for a motion to approve the negotiated standards for Title I. **Elaine Bremner made the motion to approve the Title I Negotiated Performance Measures for Program Year 2018-2019, seconded by Gary Hassen.** Vice Chairman Tovrea called for a vote, **the motion carried unanimously.** Comments followed congratulating Ms. Drew and her staff for the achievement.

➤ **IFA Title II Addendum A**

Ms. Drew moved to a discussion about the Infrastructure Sharing Agreement (IFA) between partners to pay a fair share of the operating costs and board budget. Title II asked for an addendum to the IFA/Memorandum of Understanding to demonstrate value added to the Title II program. She noted the \$14,913 added to Yavapai County. She noted the goal to close out the monitoring report finding that a demonstration of funding from all partners has not been shown. Ms. Drew stated that, in order for these funds to flow, they needed to negotiate this addendum to the current IFA for approval before the Board. It was noted that the IFA didn't go out until this morning, so Ms. Drew described the document for the Board verbally in order to allow the Board to determine if they are comfortable with approving it today. She noted that the Addendum is an agreement between the Board, Title II and the Board of Supervisors. It identifies how they will disburse funds to the local area. The funds committed by Title II Adult Basic Education go through Yavapai College, the contractor for Title II. The funds will be contributed toward One Stop operations, One Stop delivery systems and the Yavapai County Workforce Development Board budget, which will be negotiated on an annual basis. Title II clients will have access to all Title I, III and IV services. Craig Lefever noted that the laptops are essential for TABE testing, which must be done online. Following the description of the IFA Addendum, Craig Lefever noted a last minute addition from Deputy Associate Superintendent Sheryl Hart, specifying that the goal is to reach performance targets, to have a minimum number of students referred back and forth. Ms. Hart's addition was to add a more specific goal between One Stops and Title II – 40 students per year. Ms. Drew noted hesitancy to put hard-fast numbers in the document but to use them as planning, perhaps apply percentages instead. Some discussion followed regarding the application of numbers of students. Ms. Drew recommended to delay the finalization of this document to the Executive Committee. Vice Chairman called for a motion to table this Agenda item, **so moved by Elaine Bremner, seconded by Pam Blackburn. The vote was unanimous for this agenda item to be tabled to the next Executive Committee meeting.** Discussion followed briefly regarding some of the acronyms included in the document for clarification.

➤ **Bylaws Consideration**

Ms. Drew clarified that there are no bylaws consideration, however because of the negotiations with NACOG for the Executive Director position, the addendum to the Scope of Work Memorandum is what is being amended to more clearly describe roles and responsibilities of the Board and NACOG. Ms. Drew noted that this is the e-vote discussed earlier that will be taken among the Executive Committee.

➤ **Equal Opportunity Monitoring Report**

Ms. Drew reported on a recent monitoring for Equal Opportunity (EO). There was one finding that was contrary to a different program monitoring, which required the removal any reference to a disability from client files. The EO monitor says must be included in the client files. Ms. Drew noted that compliance and a response will be prepared. She noted one other observation, that new references for EO were not included in the paper files for clients although every client received the

EO paperwork; therefore the documentation is being placed in each client file. Ms. Drew concluded her report. Some comments followed regarding compliance.

**VI. Yavapai County Workforce Development Plan Discussion.**

Ms. Drew recommended a call for a motion to move into public hearing. Vice Chairman Tovrea called for a motion to move into the Public Hearing session, **so moved by Gary Hassen and seconded by Pam Blackburn.** Vice Chairman Tovrea called for a vote, **the Board voted unanimously in favor of moving into Public Hearing.**

➤ **Public Hearing**

Ms. Drew remarked that this is a time for public hearing regarding the revisions to the Plan, and reviewed the outline of the required changes and other pertinent information amended, which was prepared by NACOG staff. Ms. Drew noted that she had to completely re-do the economic analysis in order to update with current employment/unemployment data. She briefly touched on the areas of updates to the plan. Areas of update are as follows: Labor, unemployment rate, population, salaries, existing/emerging industries and sectors, earnings per occupation, lower living standards for 2018, employer-driven certifications and skills, population/labor force characteristics, education in the region, goals and strategies, Title II information, Workforce system/partners, one stop partners, labor market information on secondary/post-secondary education, access, compliance with Americans with Disabilities Act, and updates in several other areas.

Ms. Drew asked for comments, noting that all public comment must be made in writing by November 29, 2018 and the Board of Supervisors will review it for approval on December 5, 2018. The Plan was published online on October 31, 2018 and live copies are available for review and written comment at both Yavapai County One Stops. Ms. Drew noted that, while the Board is required to provide public comment opportunities on the plan, they are not required to change the plan because of public comments.

Yavapai County Supervisor Tom Thurman made a comment about the senior population in Yavapai County and asked if there is information regarding senior employment and training opportunities included in the plan. Ms. Drew replied that employment services are available to individuals from age 14 through any adult age, but there is not reference specifically to the senior citizen population. She noted that the Title V program addresses employment services for seniors, although Title V does not come under the EWD umbrella. Comments followed regarding a lack of referrals from Title V.

Wendy Bridges asked why there is reference to the coal communities of Navajo, Coconino and Apache Counties in the Yavapai County Plan. Ms. Drew responded that one of the requirements of the local workforce area is that they are required to identify economic regions, but the State of Arizona has not defined economic regions. She stated that Yavapai, Coconino, Navajo and Apache Counties make up the NACOG Region, and they have agreed to make the NACOG Region the economic region for the related workforce areas. The reference to the coal communities is included in the plan because of the economic impact for northern Arizona, which includes Yavapai County. Ms. Drew noted that a white paper has been developed by a collaboration of Northern Arizona communities and the Governor's Office of Economic Opportunity to outline the pending economic impact of the closure of major coal-related industries in Coconino, Navajo and Apache Counties, which also impacts Yavapai County. Ms. Drew reported that there is a joint effort to inform the Governor's Workforce Arizona Council of the pending coal industry shut-down and to request Rapid Response funding to assist in the re-employment of workers that will lose their jobs.

Other comments followed regarding how the data for the economic analysis was gathered. Ms. Drew and Leah Cickavage noted that the sources for data are cited throughout the Plan, and includes Wanted

Analytics and the Office of Economic Opportunity, [www.az.gov](http://www.az.gov) . Ms. Drew noted that state data was used so that the information would be recognized by the state when they review the Plan. She responded to a question regarding where the document can be found online; [www.nacog.org](http://www.nacog.org) and [www.yavapaiatwork.com](http://www.yavapaiatwork.com) . Further discussion followed regarding opportunities for assisting local employees facing layoff.

Vice Chairman Tovrea asked for any further comments. He called for a motion to approve the draft of the Plan. **Elaine Bremner made the motion to approve the Draft Plan, Gary Hassen seconded. The motion carried unanimously.** This closed the Public Hearing.

The Board resumed the regular agenda. Vice Chairman Tovrea turned the meeting over to Leah Cickavage to report on behalf of the Youth Council.

#### **VII. Youth Council Update**

Leah Cickavage reported on behalf of the Youth Council in the stead of Chairman Mel Ingwaldson, absent. She began by recommending a new member application submitted by Rich Ormond, who is the Director of Career Services at Prescott College. Mr. Ormond also works with Arizona Serve through the college's AmeriCorp program. Vice Chairman Tovrea called for discussion, and hearing none called for a motion. **Rick Duff made the motion to approve the membership application of Rich Ormond to the Youth Council, seconded by Ginger Johnson. The motion carried unanimously.**

Ms. Cickavage updated the Board on the current youth enrollment, noting 126 youth – 80 out-of-school and 46 in-school. Out-of-school is the primary target and is classified as 16-24 years old, and these individuals can be enrolled in an alternative education course and still be considered out-of-school. Ms. Cickavage noted the great partnership potential with AmeriCorps, and anticipates that, with Mr. Ormond joining the Youth Council, this will open up doors of opportunity for other services. Ms. Cickavage reported that the next meeting of the Youth Council is scheduled for January 2019, noting that the schedule is being finalized. Primary focus for Youth Council will be developing new goals, and developing the outreach plan for out-of-school youth. She asked for questions and comments. Nancy Jensen announced that NAU is opening the College Resource Center that hires AmeriCorps workers. This will be placed right across from Harkins Theater in Prescott Valley. She said that AmeriCorps staff has been hired and this would be a good resource center for the area. Other positive comments followed regarding the reporting numbers. Ms. Cickavage concluded the report of the Youth Council. Vice Chairman Tovrea then called for the One Stop Report.

#### **VIII. One Stop Report**

Ms. Cickavage reported for Quarter 1 of the 2018-19 Program Year of July 1, 2018 through September 30, 2018. She noted several layoffs from a local employer – altogether this year locally there have been 9 employers so far with closures and layoffs. Ms. Cickavage noted that this is anticipated to increase over the next quarter. She reported new employers in East and West County, primarily keeping in line with the WDB Sector Strategies – start-ups include businesses in manufacturing, healthcare, administrative positions, fire and land management, and social service agencies.

Ms. Cickavage highlighted the updates for each Title, noting that case management in Prescott Title I has doubled growth over last reporting period. She noted that there has not been a Title III presence in the West County One Stop since August 2018. Ms. Cickavage reported 2,164 services, 342 over last quarter. Cottonwood Title I demonstrated 79 more services over the last quarter, for a total of 551 services. Each quarter, Satisfaction Surveys are conducted with each client that comes in to use the One Stop services. This quarter, the results of the survey showed 98% extremely satisfied and 2% very satisfied.

The Business Assistance Center report demonstrated 250 clients, 24 agencies and businesses and 97 job placements. Job placement services are up from last quarter.

Title III reported an increase of 30 since last quarter of Unemployment Insurance assistance in Cottonwood, reporting 532 individuals assisted. Employer contacts reports are showing a decrease. Total services reported by Title III were 1,710 services. A question was asked about veteran services, to which Ms. Cickavage noted that veteran services appear to be increasing as the word gets out of the availability of services to veterans. She noted that Prescott Valley continues to report about the same number of services this quarter, reporting 1,872 services. A typographical error was noted in the Prescott Valley report, the correction needed to demonstrate July, August and September instead of April, May and June for report. It was also noted that the date of the report is incorrect on the heading.

Ms. Cickavage noted that Title II reported more information this time, reporting 209 total participants during this quarter, 4,882 total instructional hours and a 25% Measurable Skills Gain. Ms. Cickavage noted that Nicholas Del Sordi will be providing quarterly numbers for Title II. She noted that employment reports will also be included in future reports for Title II.

Job placements and trainings were reported, and in-demand vocations were mentioned again. Ms. Cickavage noted that Title IV Vocational Rehabilitation did not provide data this quarter, however she is working on developing a reporting process with them. A question was asked about working with United Way, to which Ms. Cickavage answered a new program will start in January, with United Way and the Yavapai County Contractor's Association (YCCA), which will also include the incorporation of the Arizona Career Readiness Credential (ACRC) for participants, led by NACOG staff. Participants will also be assisted by NACOG with placement after training. Ms. Drew elaborated about YCCA needing help with employing individuals in the construction trades, and their partnership with United Way to kick off a construction trades boot camp. So far three have signed up, and they are hoping for more than just three. Some discussion followed regarding construction demand and the lack of employee candidates, particularly among the youth. Ms. Cickavage concluded the One Stop Report.

Vice Chairman Tovrea called for the Eligible Training Providers List (ETPL) report.

#### **IX. ETPL Update**

Before Ms. Cickavage began her report on ETPL updates, Ms. Drew noted that if anyone has an interest in any of the programs on the ETPL, it is a conflict of interest to vote on this list. Ms. Cickavage noted the updates to the list are all new programs. Verde Academy of Career and Technical Education (VACTE) has begun opening a lot of their courses to adults as well as youth and have added them to the ETPL list. She detailed the courses on the list as well as the requirements and times. She also noted several from Yavapai College, not necessarily new courses but they would like them to be eligible for WIOA services. She noted the courses listed. All courses listed show a demand for the area. A question was asked about the cycle of the courses once approved for the list. Ms. Cickavage reported that local areas monitor the participants annually, and re-approval is generated randomly. She noted that there are no re-approvals today. It was also noted that performance reporting will be added to the monitoring. If any changes are made to the curriculum, they must reapply for the ETPL. Other discussion followed regarding the statistics, and where they come from, to which Ms. Cickavage replied O-NET Online. Other comments followed regarding the schools on the list. Ms. Drew noted that approval of this list update requires a vote. Craig Lefever recused himself from the vote as an employee of Yavapai College. Vice Chairman Tovrea called for a motion to approve the updates to the ETPL; **so moved by Wendy Bridges, seconded by Rick Duff. The motion carried unanimously.**

**X. Member Comments**

Vice Chairman Tovrea called for Member Comments, there were none.

**XI. Public Comments**

Vice Chairman Tovrea called for Public Comments, there were none.

**XII. Adjournment**

Vice Chairman Tovrea called for a motion to adjourn, **so moved by Elaine Bremner, seconded by Wendy Bridges. The meeting adjourned at 12:04 PM.**

*Minutes of the Workforce Development Board – November 14, 2018*

*Approved:*

DRAFT