

## Economic Development Council

# Tourism Committee

## Meeting Minutes

**Thursday, March 15, 2018 • 10:00 AM**  
**Sedona Rouge Hotel & Spa**  
**2250 W State Route 89A**  
**Sedona, AZ 86336**

Attendees	Present/Absent	Number of Absences for 2018
Michelle Conway, Chairman	Present	0
Becki Christensen	Present	0
Coral Evans	Absent	2
Judy Franz	Present (By Phone)	1
Tony Alba	Present	0
Maya Azzi	Present	0
Kathy Dahnk	Present	0
Michelle Masters	Present	0
Lori Pappas	Absent	1
Ann Steward	Present	0

**Guests: Heidi Hanson – By Phone (Alternate for Lori Pappas)**  
**Ginger Johnson, Training Consultant/Meeting Facilitator**

**Staff: Teri Drew, Regional Director, NACOG**  
**Jeannette Arntzen, Administrative Assistant, NACOG**

### I. Call to Order, Welcome and Introductions

Chairman Michelle Conway called the meeting to order at 10:01 AM. Roll call was taken and a quorum was present. Chairman Conway welcomed everyone to Sedona and thanked them for coming. Chairman Conway recognized Ms. Becki Christensen, Ms. Judy Franz and Mayor Coral Evans as existing Committee members and thanked them for their time and continued service. Chairman Conway thanked all new members and recognized them by name. Chairman Conway asked everyone to introduce themselves and share a little about themselves, and as an icebreaker tell everyone about their best and worst tourism experience, either personally or professionally. All shared on the phone and around the table.

## II. **Approval of Minutes – January 18, 2018**

Chairman Conway asked for questions or comments about the draft minutes from January 18, 2018. Hearing none, Chairman Conway called for a motion to approve the minutes. **Ms. Becki Christensen made the motion to approve the minutes from January 18, 2018, seconded by Ms. Judy Franz. The motion carried unanimously.** Chairman Conway moved to Item III, Chairman’s Report.

## III. **Chairman’s Report**

### ➤ **Alternates**

Chairman Conway asked all members to identify an alternate that can attend Committee meetings when they are unable and to email the name of their alternate to Ms. Arntzen by the next meeting. Ms. Drew explained that there has been much transition on the Committee over the past couple of years and something that’s been learned is when folks can’t make it, their community is left out of the decision. Ms. Drew stated that we would like to have alternates at the table to speak on your behalf however; they cannot vote. Chairman Conway moved on to the 2018 Meeting Schedule.

### ➤ **2018 Meeting Schedule**

Chairman Conway read from the meeting schedule and noted that the next meeting is on May 17, 2018, via teleconference. Chairman Conway asked if any members are planning on attending the Governor’s Conference on Tourism (GCOT) - there was a show of hands. Chairman Conway stated that GCOT is July 18<sup>th</sup> thru the 20<sup>th</sup> at the JW Marriott Camelback Inn Resort and Spa in Scottsdale and explained that last year members of the Committee that attended GCOT held the Tourism Committee meeting on the property. Chairman Conway noted that members not at GCOT will be able to join the meeting via teleconference. Ms. Drew asked Chairman Conway if a meeting space has been determined. Chairman Conway replied that we will have to do research into a meeting space. Ms. Hanson stated that Ms. Pappas will be at GCOT and will be fine meeting on site. Chairman Conway shared that an idea that came up at the tourism forum was that, on behalf of NACOG and in support of its rural communities, there is the possibility of the Arizona Office of Tourism (AOT) providing a special conference rate for rural areas to encourage more attendance from the smaller communities. Chairman Conway noted that she has reached out to AOT and is waiting on feedback; she will follow-up again. Chairman Conway added that the content of the conference is valuable whether you are in a small or large city and that much of what we do in tourism is try to maximize our budgets – we are all looking for affordable, yet big ideas. Chairman Conway said she would share any information she receives from AOT with the Committee. There was consensus that there will be an in-person Committee meeting at GCOT on July 19, 2018. Chairman Conway finished going over the meeting schedule and asked if there were any questions. Hearing none, the meeting was turned over to Ms. Drew for the Director’s Report.

## IV. **Director’s Report**

### **NACOG/EDC/Tourism Committee Orientation**

Ms. Drew began her report by stating that her presentation will review who Northern Arizona Council of Governments (NACOG) is and how and why we are involved in tourism, followed by the protocols, rules and Bylaws under which we operate. Ms. Drew explained that NACOG is a Council of Governments and its Board of Directors are local governments (Mayors, City Councils and Boards of Supervisors) in the four counties, Apache, Navajo, Coconino and Yavapai, of the Northern Arizona Region. Ms. Drew showed a PowerPoint presentation that provided an overview of NACOG including

its mission and purpose. Ms. Drew stated that as a Council of Governments NACOG is creating a voice for any of the Priorities that are identified by the four counties and twenty-four communities in our region. Ms. Drew described Regionalism and the benefits of regionalizing resources. Ms. Drew gave a brief description of all the services that NACOG provides and turned her attention to the Economic/Workforce Development Division (EWD). She explained that the EWD is the umbrella that tourism and the EDC Tourism Committee fall under. Ms. Drew stated that the mission of the Economic/Workforce Development Division/ARIZONA@WORK is to “build economic success through workforce development partnerships”. Ms. Drew stated that economic development is about job creation and sustainability. Ms. Drew went on to explain that NACOG is an Economic Development District (EDD) and gave information as to how the EDD receives funding through federal, state and local governments. Ms. Drew briefly explained that there are Workforce Development Boards in Yavapai, Coconino and Navajo Counties. Next, Ms. Drew gave an overview the Economic Development Council (EDC) and its roles and responsibilities, which includes developing the Comprehensive Economic Development Strategy (CEDS) as well as a Scope of Work/annual Goals and Priorities list. Ms. Drew informed the Committee that they have a role and purpose with the CEDS, and the focus of this afternoon will be on developing a Goals and Priorities list for the Tourism Committee. Ms. Drew concluded her PowerPoint presentation with contact information for NACOG EWD staff.

Next, the Committee was provided with a copy of the EDC Bylaws. Ms. Drew explained that the Bylaws are applicable to the Tourism Committee. Ms. Drew spoke specifically about the rules for attendance, explaining that if a member misses three (3) consecutive, regularly scheduled meetings or 50% of the meetings in a calendar year, the member will be considered to have tendered their resignation from the Committee; however, there are circumstances when excused absences are allowed. Ms. Drew noted that the Chair has discretion for retention of members. Ms. Drew encouraged everyone to read the bylaws in their entirety and especially the section on code of conduct and noted that no member or group can act or speak on behalf of NACOG or Committee. Ms. Drew thanked everyone for their commitment to serve on this Committee.

Ms. Drew noted that in the coming months the Chair will be asking for a Vice Chair to assist with meetings, per our bylaws.

Next, the Committee was provided with two handouts - “OPEN MEETING LAW 101 Arizona’s Open Meeting Law in a Nutshell” and “ROBERTS RULES CHEAT SHEET”. Ms. Drew explained that we have a parliamentary process, which is led by the Chair: The Chair asks for a motion; a member makes a motion by saying “I move to ... ” or “I move that ... ”; a member seconds the motion - seconding a motion indicates that at least two people believe the motion is worthy of a vote; the Chair calls for the vote by asking for all those in favor to say “aye” and all oppose to say “no.”, and the Chair announces the outcome of the motion. Ms. Drew asked the committee to please focus with and acknowledge Chairman Conway during conversations and acknowledged that it is sometimes difficult to do on the phone. Ms. Drew asked the Committee to refer to the ‘cheat sheet’ for additional information. Ms. Drew went on to explain that because NACOG operates with public funds, the Committee is subject to Open Meeting Law which means the public has the right to attend and participate in meetings, and all agendas and minutes are published. Ms. Drew explained that meeting minutes are not written verbatim but written in such a way that the public can read and understand what occurred at the meeting. Ms. Drew informed the Committee that they are personally liable for any misdeeds they may commit related to their membership on the Committee, and noted that NACOG provides Directors and

Officers Insurance for all Boards and Committees. Ms. Drew informed the Committee that any discussion in person, by email or by conference call amongst 3 or more Committee members constitutes a meeting and would be in violation of Open Meeting Law if the public was not afforded the opportunity to attend.

The next document provided to the Committee was the Economic Development Council Scope of Work. Ms. Drew explained that this document is provided only as a reference for the Scope of Work that the Committee will be creating today.

Ms. Drew asked the Committee to refer to page 44 of the CEDS to review the current tourism Goals and Objectives that have been approved by the Council. Ms. Drew asked the Committee to use the current Goals and objectives as a tool to help develop the Committee's new Scope of Work for this year. Ms. Drew noted that the Committee will need to include these Goals because they are part of the 5-year plan, but they are not the only Goals they can have. Ms. Drew encouraged the Committee to be "broad and be bold" in terms of what they want to accomplish and to look logically at what is doable.

Ms. Drew mentioned that NACOG had a Tourism Forum last fall and that proceeds from that event are about \$4,900. Ms. Drew noted that some of those funds can be used in support the Committee's goals, and to pay for meetings and luncheons. Ms. Drew noted that there are many parts of our region that don't have any visibility and one of the things that she has seen lately that might provide some of that visibility is drone video. Ms. Drew shared that she always likes to look at things and one of the very cool things that she came across was a drone video of Prescott Valley that is posted on the Prescott Valley Economic Development Foundation (PVEDF) website. Ms. Drew noted that she would be showing the PVEDF drone video as well as video that was produced by Cable One. Ms. Drew said that she wanted to demonstrate the drone videos to the committee to help create a vision and that maybe a website could be created that they could access and that would help drive people and visitors our area. Ms. Drew said that one of the things that she's realized in the brush of time that she has had with tourism is that there are a lot of areas that just don't have visibility. Ms. Drew said that when they first started talking about this Governor Hall was still in office. Ms. Drew shared that at that time she said "we need to take the Grand Canyon back", and noted that Nevada actually gets more income from the Grand Canyon than Arizona does. Ms. Drew stated that our region has a huge international tourist population that drives down the I-40, goes to the Grand Canyon and drives right out, and a lot of it is because they don't know other things that are open and available. Ms. Drew said she remembers when Oprah did her tour and she found Sedona and did this big blitz on her TV show about Sedona and why didn't anyone tell her about it. Ms. Drew asked "why didn't anyone tell her about it?" Ms. Drew said that part of our mission is to get the word out that Cottonwood and Jerome and Camp Verde are also in the vicinity of Sedona. Ms. Drew added that she knows they do a great job in Sedona of getting the word out and promoting all over the Verde Valley.

The Committee was shown the drone video of Prescott Valley that was produced by the PVEDF and posted on their website, and the drone video that was produced by Cable One Advertising entitled Autumn at Woolaroc. At the conclusion of the drone videos, Ms. Drew told the Committee that the intent was not to promote these companies or organizations but to help create a vision. Many members commented on other drone videos they have seen and were enthusiastic about the prospect of doing a drone video in the region. This concluded Ms. Drew's presentation. The next item on the agenda was Item V, Facilitated Planning Discussion.

## V. Facilitated Planning Discussion

### ➤ Goals and Priorities

### ➤ Scope of Work

Ms. Drew opened the discussion by introducing Ms. Ginger Johnson. Ms. Drew shared that she and Ms. Johnson have known each other for decades, literally, and that she has a lot of respect for Ms. Johnson's facilitation and training skills. Ms. Drew said that Ms. Johnson is always willing, and certainly capable, to help lead a group. Ms. Drew let the Committee know that this is not a "Ginger show" and she knows Ginger will ask everyone to dig deep and participate.

Ms. Johnson thanked the Committee for inviting her and explained that the agenda for the day's planning discussion is the Scope of Work that was designed by members of the Tourism Committee in 2015. Ms. Johnson stated that her purpose today is to lead the Committee along a path that will lead to Goals and Objectives for a new Scope of Work that will define what the Committee wants to do in 2018. Ms. Johnson stated that before the Committee moves forward, she wants to look back. Ms. Johnson read aloud the objectives and Goals from the 2015/2016 Scope of Work:

**Objective #1:** Partner with the Arizona Office of Tourism and other state and regional tourism organizations to promote their marketing programs, training programs and events throughout the EDD.

#### Goals:

- Attend and give information on Tourism events in the state and region
- Improve communications with EDC and Regional council and Committees on Tourism initiatives
- Education seminars to support communities

**Objective #2:** Serve as an informal resource for assistance to EDD communities regarding marketing/promotions and encourage regional joint marketing opportunities.

#### Goals:

- Create a link on NACOG's website for assistance on Tourism issues in the region
- Act as a resource bureau
- Add Tourism's bios to NACOG website
- Offer Case studies - Best Practice
- SubCommittee - advocate for Tourism
- Attend events related to Tourism

**Objective #3:** Continuing to strengthen sub-regional tourism efforts though the sharing of best practices, promotion and product development.

#### Goals:

- Host 2016 Spring Tourism Forum
- Demonstrate product development for rural areas
- Provide Power Point Presentations on the Economic Impact of Tourism in the NACOG Region and other documents in support of tourism areas

Ms. Johnson asked the Committee if these are Objectives and Goals they wanted to revisit or did they want to create new Objectives and Goals. Ms. Hanson commented that she thought the 3 Objectives are good and questioned how they are being measured. Ms. Hanson stated that without having a measurement, you will not be able to see how much you've accomplished. Ms. Johnson said that "measurements" has been added to her list.

Much discussion followed regarding the current challenges that everyone is facing in their communities with regard to getting local tour companies, hotels and restaurants to partner with them and to donate products and services for Familiarity (FAM) Tours and promotions. Ms. Drew stated that perhaps in a strong economy these companies feel like they don't have to work with their towns as much as they do in a struggling economy. Ms. Masters shared that this year she had to take money from somewhere else in her budget to use for entertaining journalists and/or FAM Tours from other countries. Ms. Drew suggested that if this is a common problem maybe we can work on a common goal. Ms. Steward shared that in Prescott, they are going to businesses and explaining what a FAM is. Ms. Steward suggested that perhaps it's time to go back to Tourism 101 and go out and educate the stakeholders. Ms. Drew said that within every community there is competition; if one hotel won't work with you, focus on one that will; if one tour company won't work with you; focus on the one that will, and that could possibly be a selling point. Ms. Drew added that your customer base is changing but your strategy remains the same, and maybe we work on some strategies that could bolster those budget impacts.

Ms. Azzi shared that the company she works for, Local First Arizona, has a program they call Weekendzona which is for consumers, as opposed to industry professionals, that brings groups to communities for curated experiences for 2 nights. Ms. Azzi said that in this time of social media, they encourage their participants to take photos and hash tag them so that they are marketing your community for you. Ms. Drew said when a company says they can't do free, ask what they can do. Ms. Christensen said that Apache County is so poor that they can't take advantage of the programs that AOT has to offer. Chairman Conway suggested that one whole Committee meeting could be focused on AOTs Rural Programs Grants.

Ms. Azzi pointed out that Objective 1 reads "AOT and other state and regional tourism organizations...", and suggested that the Committee identify who those other organizations are. Ms. Johnson asked if Objective 1 is going to stay the same or change. The Committee agreed that "Arizona Office of Tourism and other" will be deleted. Object 1 will be changed to read "Partner with state and regional tourism organizations to promote their marketing programs, training programs and events throughout the EDD." The Committee set about identifying state and regional tourism organizations including AOT, AzLTA, Local First Arizona, AZ Fish & Game, Forest Service, State Parks, BLM, BIA, Tribal, and higher education institutions. Ms. Drew stated that when we are talking about partnerships and identifying folks, we need to have a purpose. Ms. Drew asked the Committee to identify what it is we want to do with or for or to get from the groups, and that could help us put them in to categories like outreach, marketing, and/or training programs.

Next the Committee identified which agencies or groups fell into the category or categories of outreach, marketing, and/or training programs. Chairman Conway asked Ms. Drew what was meant by "training programs" and Ms. Drew explained that because the NACOG region is so diverse, we were thinking of train-the-trainer style programs where one or more people would attend training and bring

the training back to communities within the NACOG region. Discussion followed about how intertwined tourism is with other sectors including housing and workforce. After much discussion the Committee agreed that Objective #1 and its Goals will read as follows:

**Objective #1:** Partner with state and regional tourism organizations to promote their marketing programs, training programs and events throughout the EDD.

**Goals:**

- Survey state and regional tourism organizations and partners to determine what each has to offer and how we can partner to promote tourism in the region and create a Fact Sheet based on the survey results. The Fact Sheet will be a resource for the public and posted to the tourism page of NACOG's website.
- Create data reports on regional tourism trends and revenues and post to the tourism page of NACOG's website.

Additional discussion followed regarding marketing programs, training programs and events throughout the region. Ms. Drew shared that one of the ideas that had been discussed was holding tourism workshops after EDC meetings or during lunch when representatives from all four counties were present. Ms. Christensen stated that everyone that attended the NACOG Fall Tourism Forum really enjoyed the event and she is in support of having forums in the future.

Discussion followed on how the Objective and Goals would be measured. Ms. Masters noted that looking at a town's bed tax revenue is a good measure of how many tourists are visiting. Chairman Conway, Ms. Steward and Ms. Azzi volunteered to compile the list of state and regional tourism organizations and partners, and Councilor Dahnk and Ms. Franz volunteered to create the survey. It was agreed that the information would be submitted to NACOG by April 16, 2018. Ms. Johnson moved on to Objective #2 and its Goals.

Discussion followed regarding Goals. Ms. Drew informed the Committee that all of their bios have been posted to the NACOG website. Chairman Conway asked for suggestions on how to drive traffic to the Toolbox. Ms. Steward suggested going out and talking to communities. Ms. Masters suggested adding a "Tourism" button to the homepage of the NACOG website and promoting the Tourism page through Facebook and other social media outlets. Ms. Azzi shared that she does a monthly webinar series and offered to do a webinar focusing on tourism and have it be a platform to promote the resources that the Committee has created. Ms. Masters suggested that a shared calendar be created where individual communities can post their tourism events. Ms. Azzi brought up the idea of developing a breakout session at the Rural Policy Forum in August that would give the webinar idea a physical presence and have representatives of NACOG there to talk about the opportunities and support that NACOG provides throughout the state; it would also provide an opportunity for the Tourism Committee to speak to some of the things that the Committee supports and has to offer. Ms. Drew suggested creating a flyer for distribution at the forum that promotes the Toolbox and the website. Discussion followed regarding Best Practices and Case Studies. Ms. Drew asked the Committee to go to website and review what is in the Toolbox. Chairman Conway stated that we want to keep it fresh and simple. The Committee agreed they would all review and assess the Toolbox by April 16<sup>th</sup>. The Committee agreed that after the Toolbox is improved each member will identify and contact 3 new communities and tell them about the Toolbox and tourism resources on the website.

The Committee agreed that Objective #2 would remain the same. The Goals will be slightly changed and read as follows:

- Create a link on NACOG's website for assistance on tourism issues in the region
- Act as a resource bureau
- Offer Case studies - Best Practice
- Be an advocate and spokesperson at tourism events

Ms. Johnson moved on to Objective #3 and its Goals.

Much discussion followed regarding drone videos. Many Committee members shared that their local communities have already produced drone videos. Ms. Drew questioned who owns the actual footage and how can we leverage existing drone footage and share resources. Additional discussion followed regarding other types video, such as a drive video. The Committee agreed that each member would go back to their communities and identify what drone videos already exist, who owns the rights to it and how can we access it. It was suggested that if drone video is available, select 2 or 3 attractions that they would want featured in a video of the whole region. Ms. Azzi commented that the drone video wasn't resonating with her and that she would rather see someone with a good video camera hit the road. The conversation returned to a drive video in which someone gets in their car and drives from place to place and documents what you can do in each place. The Committee agreed that a drive video is an interesting concept. Ms. Drew stated that whatever the video is, it must be accessible on all devices. Ms. Masters shared that she created an app for the Verde Valley Wine Trail that has an interactive map. Ms. Masters stated that things change so quickly that we can't look back at the last 2 years at what didn't get done and try to catch up; we need to look forward to make sure that what we do now is going to be relevant in the next 2 years. Mr. Alba stated that AOT posts an Economic Impact Statement on their website that is updated regularly and perhaps that data can be put in an easy-to-read and understand format and post the information to the website. Ms. Azzi suggested that rather than develop a PowerPoint presentation, develop a one-page infographic. The Committee liked the idea of an infographic and Chairman Conway offered the services of her graphic designer. Ms. Azzi shared that Local First Arizona Foundation is developing Community Profiles for rural areas which can be linked to the website as another tourism promotion. The Committee agreed that Objective #3 would remain the same. The Goals will be slightly changed and read as follows:

**Goals:**

- Research and develop a drone or drive video featuring attractions in NACOG's 4-county region
- Develop an easy-to-read and understand infographic that shows the economic impact of tourism in our region and post to website
- Link community profiles to the website

Chairman Conway called for a motion to approve the 2018/2019 EDC Tourism Committee Scope of Work and its Objectives and Goals as drafted. **Councilor Dahnk made the motion to approve, seconded by Ms. Steward. The motion carried unanimously.** Chairman Conway moved to Item VI of the Agenda.

**VI. Agenda Items for Next Meeting**  
Vice Chair appointment

**VII. Member Comments**

Chairman Conway called for member comments. Many members commented on how good and helpful the meeting was.

**VIII. Public Comments**

Chairman Conway called for member comments. Ms. Drew thanked everyone for coming.

**IX. Adjournment**

Chairman Conway called for a motion to adjourn, **so moved by Ms. Steward, seconded by Ms. Masters.** The Meeting adjourned at 1:07PM.

*EDC Tourism Committee Minutes from March 15, 2018  
Approved: May 17, 2018*