

## Yavapai County Workforce Development Board Executive Committee May 10, 2018 Meeting Minutes

Attendees:	Present/Absent	Number of Absences in 2018
Anita Payne, Chairman	Present	1
Gary Hassen, Vice-Chairman	Present	1
Tracie Schimikowsky	Absent	1
Steve Silvernale	Present	1
Mark Timm	Present	1
Tim Tucker	Present	0

**Guests:** Gabe Loyola, Loyola Associates  
Marti Landis-Jones, Title IV Rehabilitative Services Administration Supervisor, Cottonwood

**Staff:** Teri Drew, NACOG EWD Regional Director  
Julia Sawyer, Executive Assistant

**I. Call to Order/Welcome/Introductions**

Vice Chairman Gary Hassen called the meeting to order at 9:02 AM. A quorum was present.

**II. Approval of the March 8, 2018 Minutes**

Vice Chairman Hassen called for a **motion to approve the minutes from the March 8, 2018 Executive Committee meeting – so moved by Mark Timm, seconded by Steve Silvernale. The motion carried unanimously.**

**III. Chairman’s Report**

• **Membership Considerations**

Vice Chairman Hassen moved to the Membership Considerations. Director Teri Drew presented the membership considerations on behalf of Chairman Anita Payne in her absence.

Ms. Drew began with the membership renewal applications, noting that, per the Bylaws, members have fixed and staggered terms with a beginning and an end, and for members to continue their membership on the Board, when their term is expiring, they must apply in the manner in which they originally applied in the sector they represent.

The first application brought was for Mark Timm, who is a member of the Executive Committee and General member as a private sector representative. Mr. Timm is a member in good standing, and there has been no change in status of his employment or Supervisorial District representation, and is recommended for renewal. **Gary Hassen made the motion to approve Mark Timm for membership renewal as a Private Sector representative, seconded by Steve Silvernale.** Vice Chairman Hassen called for a vote, **the motion carried unanimously.**

The next application was the membership renewal of Steve Silvernale, also a private sector member of the Executive Committee and the General Board, and there are no changes in his employment or Supervisorial District representation. Ms. Drew stated that Mr. Silvernale is recommended for renewal. **Mark Timm moved to renew the membership application of Steve Silvernale, Vice Chairman Hassen called for a vote, and the motion carried unanimously.**

Ms. Drew then moved to the renewal application of Robyn Prud'homme Bauer, a private sector member of the General Board. Ms. Drew noted that Chairman Payne wished to facilitate a discussion about concern with Ms. Bauer's support of the mission of the Workforce Development Board in conjunction with the consideration of her renewal. Ms. Drew reported that, as a result of her discussion with Chairman Payne, she has reached out to 2 pending Verde Valley private sector candidates for membership and is waiting for their response to the invitation to apply. One is the new General Manager for Bent-River Machine in Clarkdale, and the other is the owner of Jackson Construction in Cottonwood. Ms. Drew noted that Ms. Bauer has been on the Board since its inception, and then opened the floor for discussion. Some discussion followed regarding the positive impact of having someone in the construction industry, perhaps to work with the Yavapai County Contractor's Association. It was noted that construction is a primary industry in our area, and is a distressed industry. Ms. Drew also noted that manufacturing is one of the top Sector Strategy industry opportunities as well. Mark Timm asked for clarification and specifics regarding concerns with Ms. Bauer's support of the mission of the WDB. Ms. Drew refrained from expressing her opinion but noted that she had confronted Supervisor Garrison to discuss concerns with Ms. Bauer's renewal application, and noted that he supported Ms. Bauer's position to look out for the interests of the Verde Valley but agreed that he could see how the Executive Committee might have concerns and would encourage solution-based conversations. Other comments followed regarding the need for new representation on the Board, and eliminating conflict that does not produce solutions. Vice Chairman Hassen called for a motion, **Steve Silvernale moved to deny Ms. Bauer's application for renewal, seconded by Mark Timm.** Vice Chairman Hassen called for a vote, **the motion carried unanimously.**

Ms. Drew then brought the application of Pam Blackburn, private sector representative of APS completing her first term on the General Board. Ms. Drew remarked that Ms. Blackburn completed the second assessment of the Cottonwood One Stop and has been very involved in the goals and responsibilities of the Board, and has applied to be renewed representing the Prescott/Chino Valley area. There followed discussion regarding positive APS involvement on the Board. **Steve Silvernale made a motion to approve the renewal application of Pam Blackburn, seconded by Mark Timm. The motion carried unanimously.**

Ms. Drew presented the renewal application from Mel Ingwaldson, required labor sector representative of the General Board and Chairman of the Youth Council. Mr. Ingwaldson is a long-standing member in good standing and recommended for renewal. Positive discussion followed regarding Mr. Ingwaldson's outstanding youth involvement. **A motion to approve Mr. Ingwaldson's application for renewal was made by Steve Silvernale and seconded by Mark Timm.** Vice Chairman Hassen called for a vote, **the motion carried unanimously.**

Ms. Drew then noted that Ralph Harris was also on the list of expiring memberships, but Mr. Harris did submit an application for renewal. Ms. Drew stated that Mr. Harris may be retired as a labor representative. Discussion followed regarding reaching out to Mr. Harris, and Ms. Drew noted that several attempts were made to contact him, but to no avail. She suggested Mr. Ingwaldson may have a different way of reaching him.

Ms. Drew then moved to new member considerations. She reminded the Executive Committee that Scott Farnsworth of Yavapai College resigned his seat in January and recommended Richard Hernandez to take his place. Mr. Hernandez, the Director of the Small Business Development Center (SBDC) and the Regional Economic Development Center (REDC) at Yavapai College applied as an economic development representative, however there is no Economic Development seat available, as this position is currently held by Wendy Bridges. A comment was made regarding Ms. Bridges' recent recognition as Economic Developer of the Year – Small Community. It was also noted that Mr. Hernandez has no optimum policy making authority, but reasonable authority. It was asked if action needed to be taken since he was applying to replace Mr. Farnsworth, and Ms. Drew recommended action should be taken since Mr. Farnsworth was a Vice President at the College and Mr. Hernandez does not have that level of authority. **Steve Silvernale moved to deny the membership application of Richard Hernandez, seconded by Mark Timm, and the vote was unanimous.**

Ms. Drew reported that we also received an application from Nancy Jensen, Northern Arizona University (NAU) Associate Director at the Prescott Valley campus. Ms. Drew noted that, per recommendation from Chairman Payne, staff also reached out to Embry-Riddle Aeronautical University and Prescott College to solicit applications from the post-secondary education sector. Ms. Drew noted Ms. Jensen's experience in workforce development, and appreciated the fact that Ms. Jensen investigated the Board prior to applying, and also received 2 recommendations. Ms. Jensen is an optimum policy maker, and NAU has a presence in the community. Following discussion, **Mark Timm made a motion to approve Ms. Jensen's application. Steve Silvernale seconded the motion. The vote carried unanimously.**

Ms. Drew concluded the membership portion of the Agenda.

- **Executive Committee Discussion/Action**

Ms. Drew began discussion regarding the Executive Committee. She noted 2 points of action – first noting that the Board will not be meeting again before the elections. She reminded the Executive Committee that Chairman Payne will be slated for re-election as Chairman and Phil Tovrea as Vice Chairman. With Mr. Tovrea's assumed election in August, he will move to the Executive Committee, and as an officer will replace Tracie Schimikowsky as the District 3 representative on the Executive Committee. Ms. Drew noted that she spoke with Supervisor Garrison regarding this transfer, and Supervisor Garrison agreed that this would be the natural progression, since officers sit on the Executive Committee, per the Bylaws. He also recognized the difficulty for Ms. Schimikowsky to attend meetings.

Ms. Drew recapped the first item for consideration, that **Phil Tovrea would become an Executive Committee member and Tracie Schimikowsky would resolve back to the General Membership. So moved by Steve Silvernale and seconded by Mark Timm. The motion carried unanimously.**

Ms. Drew then discussed the second item for action; that of the required Public Voice representation. Ms. Drew noted that the Bylaws formerly stated that the Public Voice would be rotated among Department of Economic Security (DES), which is currently represented on the Executive Committee by Tim Tucker, Northern Arizona Council of Governments (NACOG) and Yavapai College, but the Bylaws no longer say that, per the changes initiated by the Workforce Arizona Council. It now says there will be a "Public Voice" on the Executive Committee, but it does not state whom. Ms. Drew noted a conversation she had with Chairman Payne, who would like to consider a labor representative as the Public Voice. Ms. Drew mentioned the 3 eligible candidates would be Mel Ingwaldson, Tony Gauthier and Rick Duff. She noted that Chairman Payne wanted input from the Executive Committee to consider a labor representative for Public Voice or to move to the public sector representatives – Craig Lefever as Title II representative, Tim Tucker of DES or Vocational Rehabilitation – Title IV, which seat currently remains vacant. Discussion followed with reserve to offer the Public Voice to the Labor Sector, questioning what

would be brought to the table in terms of workforce direction with community. It was considered by some that the DES representative would be a better choice for the Executive Committee. Ms. Drew noted that Mr. Ingwaldson has agreed to participate, and brings experience as a Chairman of the Youth Council. On another point of discussion, Ms. Drew noted the requirement of the member being an optimum policy maker in their place of business. She suggested the Executive Committee ask Yavapai College for an optimum policy maker for the Board, as it is not clear that Craig Lefever has that level of authority. Mr. Silvernale maintained that DES be retained as Public Voice for another year. Ms. Drew asked Mr. Tucker to comment, noting that he has a long drive from the Phoenix area. Mr. Tucker remarked that the drive is not an issue, and considers that it is good partnership to have representation from DES. Mr. Tucker suggested that he is flexible with whatever the Executive Committee decides. Mark Timm remarked that perhaps it would be a good idea to keep Mr. Tucker at this time, even on a temporary basis, as DES is an important partner at the table. It was suggested that this item be tabled until Chairman Payne can express her reasons for wanting the labor sector as the Public Voice representative. The item was tabled. Discussion followed briefly regarding the rotation processes with other boards.

#### **IV. Director's Report**

Ms. Drew asked a guest to introduce herself. Marti Landis-Jones, Rehabilitation Services Administration Supervisor of the Cottonwood Title IV Vocational Rehabilitation office introduced herself. Ms. Drew thanked her for attending and noted that she is hoping to receive a replacement on the Board soon, since Mark Kendall's resignation has left that partner position vacant. Ms. Landis-Jones noted that when the new supervisor for Prescott Valley is appointed, a representative would be identified for the WDB.

- **Program Update**

Ms. Drew began her report by noting that Dr. Penny Wills, President of Yavapai College has retired and announced her resignation from Yavapai College effective Dec. 31, 2018.

Ms. Drew continued to report that NACOG has lost 2 tenured staff in recent months, and offered a brief explanation as to why. A question was asked about the salary offered for those positions, and Ms. Drew replied it is currently \$18+ per hour. Discussion followed about labor market indicators and the requirements for replacing these positions. A question was asked regarding NACOG's long-term strategy regarding the workload for Program Specialists. Ms. Drew noted that NACOG is doing a process analysis and a compensation classification study currently. She reported that she is interviewing for the 2 positions, one in the Verde Valley and one in the Prescott office. One candidate was a director of a one stop in a prison, retired but wants to go back to work. Another was a director for 5 job core centers, and was also a director for ResCare.

Ms. Drew then reported that Chairman Grove of the Workforce Arizona Council has put out a call for Success stories around the local workforce areas of the State, and Ms. Drew reported that she has sent one in on RESA Wearables. The story reported that NACOG has assisted in hiring 39 employees, with a total investment of \$189,000, an average wage of \$25 per hour, and a return on investment of \$1.2 million. A comment was made about the story in the paper regarding the touting of RESA's starting wage of \$25 per hour when there are manufacturers that don't pay that much, noting that the other manufacturers have expressed displeasure regarding the report. Ms. Drew countered that the end result is to encourage other manufacturers to increase their wages. She also noted that NACOG has assisted 3 other local manufacturers with investments of well over \$404,000 and \$1.7 million direct wage impact, noting other gains including reduction of food stamp users, retail profits and more. She noted her hope that this is a paradigm shift toward better wages. Discussion followed regarding business models and incentives.

Chairman Anita Payne joined the meeting at 9:40 AM.

Ms. Drew reported that there are several Rapid Response projects, one of which is the closing of Bank of America in the Verde Valley, resulting in the loss of around 30 jobs. Sodexo is closing operations in Arizona, although Ms. Drew does not know the total impact for Yavapai County. She also reported 4 individuals from Vinyl Visions have reported being laid off, noting that a Warn notice from the state does not go out until there are 25 or more pending layoffs. Spectrum, a company similar to West Yavapai Guidance Clinic, is also laying off employees, and the Big Park School in Sedona has closed. Ms. Drew reported that another significant company is rumored to be moving out of Prescott Valley around June 2019, which will involve 188 employees averaging salaries of \$85,000 per year. This is due to poor access to labor and market by air. Some discussion followed regarding the current lack of workforce trend. Ms. Drew noted that she still needs to meet with this employer over the next year to discuss Rapid Response. Some discussion followed regarding Rapid Response funding, and Ms. Drew remarked that state reserves may be added to our expended funding as needed. Discussion followed regarding retention strategies in Rapid Response.

Ms. Drew reported that NACOG is sponsoring a Cool Air Career Fair on May 23 at the Northern Arizona University (NAU) North Valley campus in Phoenix, noting that a big push for exposure is being sent all over the area through the Arizona Office of Tourism, Arizona Lodging and Tourism Association, media outlets and libraries. Ms. Drew remarked that NAU has been fabulous in their provision of the facility.

Ms. Drew continued to report that the new YAVAPAI@WORK Website is live as of last week, and she is in discussion with Cable One to extend contracting. Some discussion followed regarding the website.

Ms. Drew noted that the One Stop certification did not pass because the Verde Valley location's assessment was not completed. Deficiencies have to be identified at all sites within a year, and corrective action has to be identified also. Ms. Drew reported that the deficiencies identified have been fixed; noting that the Verde Valley restroom ADA compliance is complete, and a receptionist has started this week as a Work Experience client on an internship. Ms. Drew noted that the hours at the Verde location can't be extended to 9 PM as was suggested, due to the DES office being regulated by the security hours that are available. However, our NACOG staff can and will start at 7:30 as opposed to 8:00 in order to extend hours. A question was asked regarding the possibility of access through a 24-hour kiosk, and Ms. Drew noted that access to Arizona Job Connection 24 hours 7 days a week. Ms. Drew pointed out that the only compliance item we are still waiting on is a Title II presence in the One Stops, and negotiations are taking place with Title II to offer recruiting at the One Stops. She reported that Title II has moved to Prescott Valley so there is no longer Adult Basic Education service in Prescott. Ms. Drew reported that a Computer Lab is being set up at the NACOG office to be offered as a solution for some Title II activities.

Ms. Drew spoke regarding her United States Workforce Association (USWA) appointment, reporting on government happenings in funding and the recouping of WIOA funds for states, noting that some governors are assigning 100% of Title I funding to state agencies, however in our state, the Governor has recouped carry-over funds for education. Ms. Drew also noted that the White House is considering rescinding of some of the budget items just past. However, it isn't expected that Congress would rescind funds in an election year.

- **Board Certification**

Ms. Drew reported that the Workforce Development Board has been officially recertified for another 2 years.

- **Infrastructure Funding Agreement**

Ms. Drew also reported that the Infrastructure Funding Agreement discussions are still in progress.

Ms. Drew turned the meeting over to Chairman Payne to revisit the agenda item regarding labor representation as Public Voice on the Executive Committee.

Chairman Payne started the discussion. Mark Timm summarized the previous discussion regarding reinstating Tim Tucker of DES as Public Voice. Chairman Payne said it's always been the goal to include everyone at the table, think outside the box and include labor as a different perspective. Ms. Drew reiterated previous discussion regarding DES and Title II. Chairman Payne asked if the Committee wished to table the discussion or prepare to vote; all agreed to table the decision.

- **Director's Job Description**

Ms. Drew passed around examples of the Workforce Innovation and Opportunities Act (WIOA) law stating that a Director of the Board is required. She also passed out the proposed Job Description of the Director, as well as her biography. Chairman Payne noted that what she has observed over the years is that most directors around the country, such as Ms. Drew is to this Board, are executive directors. Chairman Payne asked for input and discussion, noting that the title of Executive Director is more aligned with what Ms. Drew does for the Board and this community. Chairman Payne noted that this will be discussed again at a future date. Chairman Payne acknowledged what Ms. Drew has represented in the county. Ms. Drew reminded the Executive Committee about the firewalls built into WIOA policy – firewalls that separate Title I and the Director of the Board. She noted that she will work for the Board and that she reports to County Administrator and Executive Committee. She also noted that, according to a new law in WIOA, the Board has authority to hire a Director and staff. Some discussion followed regarding this being a new discussion to this Board, and much has to be reviewed, including a job description, alignment with the mission of the Board, and to assure that the title is appropriate internally and externally. Ms. Drew noted that the Draft of the job description came from other areas as well; like and similar information was added to this job description. Ms. Drew noted that she will remain an employee of NACOG. A question was asked where the funding would come from, to which Ms. Drew replied that it should be a fair share cost, however DES can't pay salaries and fringe. The County has engaged NACOG to be the administrative entity, and Ms. Drew was appointed Director on behalf of NACOG.

Ms. Drew reminded the Executive Committee that the WDB is not an entity, which means they can't hire or fire – and that they would be individually responsible for action taken; therefore the County is the responsible entity. Ms. Drew noted that she has reviewed the job description draft with County Administrator Phil Bourdon, and he has approved it. Some discussion followed regarding Board responsibilities. Discussion followed regarding whether or not to hire a director or if the Board could operate the One Stops without the services of a contractor. It was noted that there is a difference between the One Stop Operator and the Director of the Board and Local Area. Chairman Payne asked the Committee if they wanted to table this agenda item or take action. More discussion followed, noting that responsibility for all reports and records to the WDB and Board of Supervisors should be added to the essential duties and responsibilities. It was also recommended to strike the reference to "directs boards".

Ms. Drew reiterated the options for the Committee – elect to not hire a Director, or elect to seek other directors, or elect to approve or disapprove these qualifications. Steve Silvernale began to formulate a motion to approve with changes identified, and Mark Timm amended the motion to change the title from Director to Executive Director. Mr. Silvernale clarified the motion and added to confirm Ms. Drew as the Executive Director. Chairman Payne noted that in proposing to hire an Executive Director, a salary study must be prepared, and she will form a sub-committee to discuss the Executive Director's

salary. Chairman Payne noted that she will email everyone with the results of the salary study when she has a complete report. She also reiterated that this discussion was not Ms. Drew's idea, but hers. She thanked Ms. Drew for the information. Ms. Drew reminded Chairman Payne and the Executive Committee that, per the Open Meeting Law, emails should not be replied to "all" so as to not give the appearance of a session without notice to the public. Mark Timm offered to assist with the salary study. Steve Silvernale repeated the **motion for clarity to accept the job description as written with the changes discussed, striking "direct" from essential duties bullet point 12, and to add to bullet point 11 to report to WDB and Board of Supervisors, and to add "Executive" to the title of Director; and to confirm Ms. Drew as the Executive Director and to form a sub-committee to review compensation options. Gary Hassen seconded.** Chairman Payne called for a vote; **the motion carried unanimously.**

- **Logo Policy**

Ms. Drew noted that the ARIZONA@WORK logo was developed by the State of Arizona Workforce Division, and through transitions in DES, new policies are being developed and implemented at the state level regarding uses of the logo. Locally, we have purchased YAVAPAI@WORK and ARIZONA@WORK YAVAPAI COUNTY. Ms. Drew recommended restriction of use of the logo reserved for activities where we or our partners would be participating, with her discretion to give permission. Ms. Drew noted that the logos were trademarked because they were purchased with our funds. Discussion followed regarding the use by partners in DES using it only with permission, to which Ms. Drew replied that the distinction would be that ARIZONA@WORK may be used until the State develops a policy, but that ARIZONA@WORK YAVAPAI COUNTY would require permission to be used, as well as YAVAPAI@WORK. She also noted that slogans would also be included in the policy, such as the WDB slogan "Serving, Solving, Sustaining". Mr. Silvernale began making suggested edits to the policy:

- Bold USAGE heading.
- 1<sup>st</sup> paragraph needs to be clearer regarding the conditions of violation; should include the definition of trademark found in paragraph 2.
- Last sentence of the 1<sup>st</sup> paragraph is a run-on sentence, should give the conditions of violations.
- Scratch "owner" and replace with "authority".
- Usage – no interest in or title to should be struck
- Settings – strike "everything"
- Requests for usage should be made in writing
- User must follow all of grantors instructions
- Process, request in writing (email or letter)
- Set up as a template – policy statement, purpose, detail

Ms. Drew noted she will reformat the Policy and bring it back for review at the next meeting. The item was tabled.

## **V. One Stop Operator Process Discussion**

Chairman Payne turned the meeting over to Gabe Loyola to begin a discussion regarding the process of designating a One Stop Operator. Mr. Loyola recapped how the process was done 3 years ago and the following responses by the feds later regarding rules and guidance letters. More policies regarding the procurement of a One Stop were later added by the Workforce Arizona Council. In some locations, legal entities did the process. In other areas, Boards of Supervisors make the decision as to how the funding flows. He gave an example of how not to do it, including felonious actions and the ramifications of this process.

The new law has more restrictions with a series of firewalls to promote a more agreeable solution to the process. Mr. Loyola noted that this Board followed required procedures, and the findings or citations of

best practice that were identified are easily fixed. His recommendation is to do the procurement as before; keep it clean and simple.

Other findings from the previous Request for Proposals (RFP) revealed that there were too many requirements, and too short of a timeframe for responding; also that it was not advertised enough. Now the RFP has to be advertised through the WAC website. Mr. Loyola noted that these are minor fixes – make the timeframe 30 days instead of 15 days; and post the RFP to the WAC website. He recommended the Executive Committee set up a sub-committee to select from the responses to the RFP. Ms. Drew noted that another finding was that there was Inherent conflict of interest because the board members were not identified by name, and the public has the right to know who scored what. It was noted that this finding is not a law or statute, but it was a WAC interpretation.

Mr. Loyola reiterated the process step by step. He suggested to eliminate individual score sheets and make one score sheet derived by discussion and vote. Some discussion followed. Ms. Drew summarized the option of retaining a consultant to lead the process, and Mr. Loyola noted that he had prepared the last RFP and managed the process. Ms. Drew said the County does not want to procure because policy would have to be changed for this one process. **Steve Silvernale made a motion to proceed with RFP with Mr. Loyola to prepare it as the Consultant, to be reviewed at the next meeting. The motion was seconded by Mark Timm.** Chairman Payne called for questions or comments. Mr. Loyola clarified the process for the record; he will send a draft RFP with some proposed deadlines, following the review of the comments the DES monitors provided to assure compliance; once approved, it will be issued and a copy of the RFP will be provided to the State; Mr. Loyola will send multiple copies to DES, the WAC and the staff to the WAC. He noted that since the last RFP process, the NACOG website was re-designed, and the original notice that was posted on the website was eliminated during the change-over, therefore, to eliminate questions, screen shots of everything will be taken as proof. Ms. Drew noted for the sake of the public that today's discussion is about process only, and therefore hers and Tim Tucker's presence during the discussion is allowable. She noted that in future proceedings, the Executive Committee will go into Executive Session, which will not be open to the public. Chairman Payne thanked Mr. Loyola for the clarification and called for a vote on the motion. **The motion carried unanimously.**

Chairman Payne thanked Mr. Loyola for bringing the discussion to the table.

**VI. Hoovers Platform Presentation/Demonstration**

This agenda item was passed. Ms. Drew briefly described the database company that she recently contracted with, and will bring this presentation to a later meeting.

**VII. Member Comments**

Chairman Payne called for member comments. Steve Silvernale reported an offer to bid transportation of 200 employees from Wickenburg and Prescott to a large 8-week building project beginning in Bagdad.

**VIII. Public Comments**

Chairman Payne called for Public Comments there were none.

**IX. Adjournment**

Chairman Payne called for a motion to adjourn, **so moved by Mark Timm and seconded by Steve Silvernale. The meeting adjourned at 11:07 AM.**